



MEETING MINUTES

Chief's Advisory Committee (Virtual) Tuesday, May 25, 2021

Welcome to Committee by Chief Páez

Chief Páez welcomed the committee. Thanked all for coming together again. He turned the meeting over to Chair and Co-Chair Judge Maynard and Ms. Ajmeri Hoque.

Dwayne Maynard welcomed all to the meeting and thanked all for being a part of the CAC. Dwayne Maynard shared some thoughts on the one-year anniversary of the death of George Floyd and the ongoing efforts of the CAC who have committed to building bridges with the police department and varied diverse community groups and constituencies in Dublin.

Committee members present: W. Dwayne Maynard, Ajmeri Hoque, Susan Ortega, Imran Malik, Isao Shoji, Stella Villalba, Courtney Ingram, Sri Gaddam; Cameron Justice; Police Department members present: Chief Justin Páez, Lt. Nick Tabernik, PIO Rebecca Myers, Officer Amber McCloskey, Corporal Devin Howard; Guest: Corporal Jace Dalgord
Minutes by: Becky Metcalf

Committee Business

- **Attendance**

Chief Páez called roll for the meeting:

Judge Dwayne Maynard - present

Ajmeri Hoque – present

Sri Gaddam – present

Cameron Justice –present

Susan Ortega – present

Imran Malik – present

Cortney Ingram – present

Isao Shoji – present

Stella Villalba – present

Yanling Yin – not present

- **Review/Amend/Adopt Last Meeting's Minutes**

Previously posted amended minutes were reviewed by the committee. Dwayne Maynard asked if everyone had an opportunity to review the amended minutes and if there were any comments or corrections to be made. Cameron Justice advised he was listed as present but was not present at the April 22, 2021 meeting. Chief Páez advised the minutes would be updated to reflect the correction. Dwayne Maynard asked for a motion to accept the minutes from April 22, 2021, as they had been amended/corrected. Ajmeri Hoque moved to accept the minutes from the April 22, 2021 meeting, as they had been amended/corrected. Isao Shoji seconded.

Dwayne Maynard asked if anyone opposed; no responses were received. Amended meeting minutes from the April 22, 2021 CAC meeting were accepted as amended/corrected without objection.

Old Business

Dwayne Maynard asked if there was any old business to address. Rebecca Myers advised that during the last meeting there was discussion about the creation of a shared calendar. The City of Dublin has a new IT Manager, Michael Ferrara, with whom she is meeting next week. She will discuss getting the shared calendar underway at their meeting.

Chief's Update to Committee

Chief Páez shared information on the Community Against Hate event that took place at Coffman Park on May 15, 2021. The police department in partnership with APAPA Ohio hosted the event. Chief Páez deferred to Lt. Tabernik who shared more details as well as some photos from the event. Both Ajmeri Hoque and Imran Malik (who spoke at the event) attended. Additionally, some Dublin City School students gave some very candid and moving speeches. The police department captured some of the photos with a drone and shared capabilities of the drone at the event.

Chief Páez provided information about the Ohio Collaborative Community Police Advisory Board for the State of Ohio. He is the OACP (Ohio Association of Chiefs of Police) Representative on the board. The board met today (5/25/2021) and passed a standard on "Officer Wellness" which will become a standard in the State of Ohio for law enforcement agencies. The standard requires agencies to have an officer wellness policy within their organization in order to be certified by the Ohio Collaborative as a law enforcement agency in Ohio. The Dublin Police Department has been working in partnership with members of the CAC and other members of the department to establish a peer support team for all employees in the organization. Other discussions and presentations that occurred during the meeting were related to recruiting and law enforcement interactions with juveniles. The board moved forward with an initiative to develop an Ohio standard for law enforcement interactions with juveniles and hope to have a draft standard available in September. The other presentations were related to recruitment, focusing on recruiting minorities and females into the profession of law enforcement; Lt. Lattanzi sits on the board for recruitment.

Chief Páez thanked Dwayne Maynard and Isao Shoji for their input on the CAC aspirational goals for the CTF and to Dwayne Maynard and Ajmeri Hoque for their assistance and input preparing the update memo to Council.

Ajmeri Hoque asked about the law enforcement interaction with juveniles standard; if there is an example they are looking at or how are the standards created. Chief Páez advised that they start with presentations from various groups or persons who are immersed in that particular field of expertise. They conduct studies and observations and take all of that information into account to formulate standards.

Dwayne Maynard commented that it is great that both Chief Páez and Lt. Lattanzi are involved in these committees and can share that information with the CAC. Dwayne Maynard asked the other community partners if they had any questions or anything to share about the information

provided by the Chief in his update but deferred first to Imran Malik so that he could share his input on the Community Against Hate event.

Imran Malik advised that one of the highlights was the message from the Chief as well as the City Council Member who spoke. The youth that spoke are members of Dublin Coffman, he does not have video but does have audio from the event, which can be shared with the community. They imparted a lot of passion, hope and optimism in their eloquently delivered speeches. Imran advised that the message was to continue building outreach, support, and finding partnership and synergy points in the work we are doing. He also shared that he is about to embark on an 18 month-long journey of learning and service participating in discussions with think-tanks of universities, academia professionals, politicians, and law enforcement nationwide related to the events which occurred January 6, 2021.

Sri Gaddam shared positive comments regarding the police reaching out to leaders of the community. In addition, he asked if it is possible to reach out once a month to talk with those same leaders. He feels this will increase confidence within the community that Dublin Police cares. Chief Páez advised that is a great suggestion and that the department will make every effort to engage in our community. He agreed there should be a regular mechanism to provide resources and information in one singular place. Chief Páez met recently with a group from St. John's Lutheran Church and participated in a panel forum along with Chief Grile of the Hilliard Police Department. He also had the opportunity to meet with hotels in Dublin regarding crime prevention and make connectivity with staff at those hotels. Additionally, there are upcoming opportunities with the Chamber of Commerce to meet with small businesses in the community, and a meeting next week with the Ballantrae HOA. He reiterated that the police department is always open to opportunities to meet in person with the community.

New Business

Dwayne Maynard asked if there was any new business to address in terms of current events or Juneteenth recognition. Ajmeri Hoque asked about the DORA (Designated Outside Recreation Area) that started that previous week; how the department is responding to DORA and what were the preparations for the DORA. Chief Páez deferred to Lt. Lattanzi to discuss, as he was heavily involved in the planning efforts. Lt. Lattanzi advised that the department had a meeting that week with Crawford Hoying; the department increased staffing efforts for the initial phase-in of the program and deployed a drone over the weekend to gauge activity. He was happy to report there were no significant issues during the first week. The department will continue those efforts throughout the pilot program and address any safety concerns. Cortney Ingram asked if you could take your drinks across the Link Bridge. Lt. Lattanzi advised you cannot. There are two separate DORA districts. One for Historic Dublin and one for Bridge Park and the bridge is not included in either of those districts currently. The pilot program is scheduled to go thru August on Thursdays, Fridays and Saturdays from 5pm-10pm. City Council will review activities at that time to determine if the DORA should stay and/or if it should be modified in any way.

Rebecca Myers shared information about Juneteenth Recognition and asked if anyone had any initial thoughts or ideas they would like to share for messaging from the CAC. She suggested a written message or video from the CAC and also possibly a joint message from the CTF. Isao Shoji advised there was no discussion during the last CTF meeting regarding a Juneteenth message. Ajmeri Hoque suggested that our African American brothers and sisters should lead

the discussion on Juneteenth and how they best want us to celebrate with them if they do. We can reach out to leadership in the city and the CAC and try to coordinate with them. Imran Malik liked the idea of the video messaging. Dwayne Maynard asked for input from Cameron or Courtney. Cameron shared the sentiment to allow our Black brothers and sisters to lead and extend out to the community as well. Courtney Ingram advised she does not have a strong opinion but seconds the opinions of other committee members and agrees social media is the best way to get that information out; she is open to being part of whatever takes place. Rebecca advised she would work with the leaders of both committees, or messaging can just come from the CAC, but she will be the contact person. Dwayne Maynard asked how much time to allot for filming and preparation and suggested at least filming a week to two in advance to ensure the messaging would go out on June 19th. He asked Isao Shoji to facilitate a conversation with the leaders of the CTF and he will discuss with Courtney and Cameron over the next few days and get back to Rebecca about the details.

Body-Worn Cameras Presentation

Cpl. Jace Dalgord presented information on the Body-Worn Camera Program. He introduced himself and shared a PowerPoint presentation. <\\Vm-nt-usrdata\home\metcbd\Chiefs Advisory Committee\May 2021\Body-Worn Camera Final.pptx> Upon completion of the presentation Cpl. Dalgord entertained any questions or comments.

Sri Gaddam asked about any data analytics, artificial intelligence and if there any plans to do anything like that with the body worn camera data; does anyone do anything with the data. Cpl. Dalgord advised the data collected is only video and audio; he does not believe there is anything reference data analytics to the level he is describing. Chief Páez advised data mining is a growing field but not available from this vendor at this time, however the data footage is an excellent tool to analyze for training purposes.

Cameron Justice asked about the playback feature technology and asked why there is no audio during that time. Cpl. Dalgord advised there may be some adjustments that can be made but private conversations that could occur before an event was the main consideration. Chief Páez advised that the lookback does not currently capture audio but provides that progression into an event. He further explained that a time had to be picked of where the officer would start capturing the event but some private conversation, which occurs prior to an event, is not captured.

Ajmeri Hoque asked if they would be moving toward an automatic trigger or just that the officer choosing when to turn on the body camera. Chief Páez deferred to Cpl. Dalgord to talk about the automatic triggers. Cpl. Dalgord explained that the policy currently requires an officer turn on their body camera if they are taking any enforcement action or involved in any interaction that potentially could involve any legal action. There are some automatic triggers that activate the body cameras: when overhead cruiser lights are turned on; when the vehicle is involved in a crash; or when they do not have their lights and siren on and the cruiser is travelling above the set speed. For the most part, the officer is following policy and procedure. Chief Páez asked Cpl. Dalgord to discuss the feature which allows you to go back and capture an event at a later time.

Cpl. Dalgord discussed a feature called "record after the fact" on both cruiser and body cameras. This is a function that records on a continuous loop for a certain period of time allowing you to go back and capture video within that timeframe. Body cameras have about a 12-hour storage

time; cruiser camera storage is longer as they have more storage space. Ajmeri Hoque asked about how inappropriate use of body cameras is monitored, for instance conversations that are recorded that have nothing to do with a case. Cpl. Dalgord advised there is policy regarding this type of recording but in regards to monitoring it would be difficult without knowing or being informed that such a recording exists. He advised that it would be very time consuming to review all recordings.

Chief Páez explained that as the department introduced the technology, we knew as an agency that we had both the opportunity and obligation to make sure we learned from experiences over time and with that learned how we progress our policy to answer those questions. He asked Lt. Lattanzi to share the department's thoughts on revision of the policy so we are more systematically capturing our review of body camera video from a supervisory level.

Lt. Lattanzi advised there was an amendment to the policy regarding reviews. We were not capturing in policy the number of reviews that our supervisors were actually doing. The policy was amended to reflect that every officer has, at a minimum, a review every trimester. This is similar to our EWS (Early Warning System) which is a mechanism to capture certain activities (pursuits, use of force, use of firearms, use of Taser, and complaints) that officers are engaged in to ensure there is no pattern of conduct. The body worn cameras should fall into a similar review process.

Isao Shoji asked how the videos are kept and who has access and if these videos are subject to public records requests. He assumes that there is custody of videos, which is not in dispute whether something exists, but how do you ensure there is no possibility to accuse the Dublin Police Department that a video could not be erased? Cpl. Dalgord advised that the video is maintained on its own server by the City of Dublin IT Department. Videos can't be deleted unless authorized by the Chief of Police. There is chain of custody and each video has an audit trail attached to it. The Court Liaison creates case packets for court and any time anything occurs to that video, WatchGuard maintains a log.

Isao Shoji asked how often videos are requested. Cpl. Dalgord did not have an exact number but advised Wendy Greasamar gets regular requests. Chief Páez advised he does not have an exact number but it does not happen as frequently as we anticipated. It is very time consuming to redact the video as required by law. For an event it may take up to a week to produce a request. What we have found is that we do not have as many requests that overwhelm us. He recalls two major requests from the media that would have been extremely time consuming. In those instances, the department reached out to get more specificity to see what exactly they were looking for in order to streamline the request.

Dwayne Maynard asked for clarification on the Dublin Records Commission. Chief Páez advised that is the body that establishes and maintains the retention of records for the City of Dublin. They assemble periodically to review all records retained in the City of Dublin to make adjustments or amendments. Dwayne Maynard asked if they are city staff persons, other staff and/or community members. Chief Páez advised he does not know who makes up the entire body but the court administrator has a role, Jay Somerville from the Police Department and someone from legal but he can get that information.

Dwayne Maynard asked who the Technical Services Bureau Director is. Chief Páez advised that is Director Jay Somerville. Lt Lattanzi is the Operations Bureau Commander and Lt. Tabernik is the Support Services Bureau Commander.

Chief Páez provided information on the current Records Commission members: Consists of representatives appointed by the City Manager, the Director of Finance, the Law Director, and a citizen appointed by City Council to serve a three-year term. They identify and preserve the City's historical records and documents for the future. Current Members: Stephen J. Smith, Jr. – Law Dept.; Laura Colwell – Citizen Representative; Lisa Wilson – Court Administrator (Chair); and Jerry O'Brien – Finance Dept.

Dwayne Maynard suggested that more frequent review of body camera video would provide more transparency, which is important in building trust in the community.

Chief Páez advised he would go back to the Records Supervisor and get more information as to the number of requests received.

Imran Malik asked about different protocol or procedure in regards to sharing that information with another police department. Chief Páez advised that those requests would not require redaction since it is not being released to the public.

Dwayne Maynard asked if there were any other questions. Ajmeri Hoque advised she did not have any questions at the time but may after she has had time to think about it. There were no other questions from the committee.

Aspirational Goals

Chief Páez outlined the requirements of both the CAC and CTF as part of the resolutions. The CTF is required to provide a final report to council by August of this year and the CAC is to provide periodic updates of its progress. The CTF and CAC reconciled both updates to provide information to Council at the May 4, 2021 council meeting. The CTF final report to council deadline is August unless they ask for and are granted an extension. In June, the CTF will come together with all recommendations of the various sub-committees and information from the public safety arena. They are hoping when they come together in June to determine what work needs to be done in order to finalize their report during the July meeting in order to present their recommendations to council in August. The chairs and co-chairs of both committees, along with Isao Shoji, met to discuss aspirational goals from the public safety perspective to be offered to the CTF as part of their report. Chief Páez asked Isao Shoji if he had anything to add. Isao Shoji advised he did not have anything to add.

Chief Páez presented the draft bullet points for the public safety recommendations to the CTF for their report. He looked at three documents to assist in developing these bullet points: the Beaverton Plan (DEI Plan from Beaverton, OR); The Principles of Procedurally Just Policing from the Justice Collaboratory from Yale Law School, January 2018 report, and The University of Michigan Division of Public Safety and Security Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Plan, 2016 to 2020. He used those documents to help develop bullet points while also folding in discussions of the CAC. Chief Páez briefly reviewed the document, which had previously been shared with the CAC.

Dwayne Maynard thanked Chief Páez for the overview and advised that a lot of work went into the document. He asked the committee members to share their input and comments. Ajmeri Hoque also asked that they provide constructive criticism.

Sri Gaddam recommended three ideally and five maximum actions that need to be measured for each category, which if possible, are supported by data. He commented that if you have more than five nothing gets done and that it is not possible to tackle everything.

Isao Shoji added that having seen what other groups have done in their respective areas of the CTF, that the chief, chair and co-chair have gone beyond expectations; not just from the number of bullet points but for the thoughtfulness that went into the entire document. The committee should prioritize and make clear what the CAC priorities would be. He agrees that Dr. Gaddam's point is valid, prioritize what we want and save some items for further discussion.

Stella Villalba thanked them for the hard work on the draft and suggested short term goals and long term goals in phases (i.e., phase one, phase two); there are so many great goals but they don't have to happen all at the same time and some can possibly be merged into one goal. She also suggested a wording change, instead of using the term minority she suggested changing to minoritized or global majority.

Ajmeri Hoque advised that she likes the idea of phases, which would provide a focus for each stage.

Rebecca Myers shared that discussions she has had with the Chief and Lieutenants leaned toward having goals in phases, having granular goals which could be accomplished within several months, then there could be five year goals and ten year goals.

Dwayne Maynard advised that he appreciates the input. The CAC is still responsible for turning in something at the end of the year as well. The CAC can provide a pared-down version of goals, aspirations and action items and continue to work on what the CAC wants to direct their focus and report on to council. He is all for paring down and prioritizing then providing "umbrella" categories to the CTF.

Sri Gaddam suggested of the four items, that Promoting Public Safety and Sense of Security be highlighted as the main title, then determine how to measure that, an example being attending community events once they are identified. Transparency and accountability relates to reporting or communicating with the community. Also, diversifying and educating or making sure police are more educated on diversity and equality.

Susan Ortega echoed the other comments made by the committee members. She leans toward a lot of what others have shared and advised that the CAC needs to have measureable goals. All were so good and she does not want to cut anything out but agrees to focus on first steps using SMART goals; making things measurable so we can share successes. SMART – S=Specific; M=Measureable; A=Achievable; R=Relevant; T=Time-bound

Imran Malik echoed all comments and advised this is a great start and blueprint to guide the committee. He suggests breaking them down into more project specific goals with timelines associated. He also suggests finding out if there are common goals with the other partners (Council and CTF) and to prioritize those goals.

Dwayne Maynard commented that the CTF asked the CAC to provide the public safety component of their presentation to City Council. The CAC has the potential to be an ongoing committee. The CTF is in existence for a year but could turn into an advisory group, which may want to do something different than what the task force is doing. The CAC has its own report to turn in by the end of the year; as for measurable goals, there may be a couple of things. He advised that what has been put down in this document, is the work that the CAC has been doing over the past several months to help the police department. The CAC has been doing good work on behalf of the community and it is evident as indicated by the document.

Stella Villalba agreed and commented about the wonderful ongoing conversations of the CAC over the past nine meetings. She believes there are huge things to accomplish, especially when talking about policies, and getting community input, which is a long process. The CAC may have to decide and prioritize what to work on, she would like for the CAC to do all that was included in the document, but the CAC cannot do them all but can at least get some things started and in a good place.

Chief Páez appreciates the feedback; he commented that sometimes his ambition sometimes exceeds his capacity. It is the CAC's eagerness, earnestness and investment in wanting to do the right work collectively as a group to ensure we are considering what public safety looks like in Dublin and what it should look like in the future. The document was an effort to throw all of our ideas out on the table. There have been great ideas on how we might organize the goals affectively. They will go back and re-sort and get revised goals back out to the group which meets the timeline of the CTF.

Stella Villalba volunteered to look at the document again and see if there are repeats. Ajmeri Hoque requested she do that.

Dwayne Maynard asked if there were any other comments on the particular agenda item. He asked if anyone had was anything to add for the good of the order.

Rebecca Myers advised there was no public commentary for the meeting.

Lt. Lattanzi will send the following information out in a more professional document but wanted to share upcoming testing dates for the position of police officer for the City of Dublin. The dates are 6/26/2021 and 6/27/2021; applications are now being accepted through 6/21/2021 at midnight, for more information go to: <https://dublinohiousa.gov/join-the-team/joindpd.org>
Imran Malik asked if the information was okay to share. Lt. Lattanzi advised yes, please share.

Chief Páez advised if any CAC member has anyone with any questions about the process or about our department to give them our information. The police department is happy to have those conversations and provide information.

Dwayne Maynard asked Chief Páez to ask each member if they had anything to share or any other comments. Chief Páez went through the list.

Stella Villable – nothing additional to add .

Isao Shoji shared that he has been hearing comments from the Japanese community about recent communication from the City of Dublin and Police Department and how it adds to their comfort level.

Courtney Ingram – nothing additional to add but she appreciates the comments and participation from everyone.

Imran Malik thanked all for the work they are doing on the CAC. He advised that he received a call earlier in the week regarding a situation involving the police department and a member of the community. He advised he reached back out to the community to see what resources they could contribute and it was very heartwarming the response he received; he is working on setting up a meeting with the chief and department. He commented that the work of the CAC is not only in a silo. It is very community oriented work, when you see that kind of response specifically from the Muslim community that is part of Hilliard, Dublin and the vicinity, they were very appreciative of the way the department was handling the situation.

Susan Ortega echoed all comments and appreciates being a part of the committee and team. She commended Stella and Courtney for surviving this school year and asks all to continue to think about families as we move into summer and consider how to continue to offer support throughout the community.

Cameron Justice had nothing to add but thanked all for their time and attention and commented that it is a privilege to be a part of the CAC and continue to do this good work.

Sri Goddam thanked all for their service and all the department is doing.

Ajmeri Hoque commented that she is excited that soon the CAC will be able to meet in person and looks forward to seeing all in person and serving the community more.

Dwayne Maynard commented that the CAC came together under difficult circumstances. What this committee has become and what the relationship with the police department has been is more than what he expected. He is very happy and grateful to have the opportunity to serve with all on the committee and he thinks the CAC is doing good work. He is now beginning to appreciate that the CAC is laying the foundation for a committee that is able to assist the chief and the department in the next three, five ten years out and he is proud to be a part of the process.

Dwayne Maynard asked for a motion to adjourn. Ajmeri Hoque moved to adjourn and Cameron Justice seconded. The meeting was officially adjourned at 7:54 PM.

Dublin Police Department - Contact Information
614-410-4800

Chief Justin Páez

jpaez@dublin.oh.us

Lt. Greg Lattanzi

glattanzi@dublin.oh.us

Lt. Nick Tabernik

ntabernik@dublin.oh.us

Director Jay Somerville

jsomerville@dublin.oh.us

Corporal Devin Howard

dhoward@dublin.oh.us

Officer Amber McCloskey

amccloskey@dublin.oh.us